

Taking the State to Court

Public Interest Litigation
and the Public Sphere
in Metropolitan India

Hans Dembowski

Asia House's online version
of the book originally published in 2001.

Contents

Acknowledgements

Glossary

- | | |
|--|----|
| 1. Introductory Overview | 1 |
| 2. Democracy, Development and Functional Differentiation | 8 |
| 2.1 Why Democratic Governance Depends on the 'Public Sphere' | |
| 2.2 Historical Connotations of 'Civil Society' | |
| 2.3 Neoliberal 'Good Governance' and Leftist 'Democratization' | |
| 2.4 Governance Problems after Colonial Rule | |
| 2.5 Governance in India | |
| 2.5.1 'Erosion of the State' versus 'Resilience of Democracy' | |
| 2.5.2 A Critique of Indian Communitarianism | |
| 3. The Changing Role of the Indian Judiciary | 48 |
| 3.1 Problematic Rule of Law in a Historical Perspective | |
| 3.2 The Courts and the Political System | |
| 3.3 Public Interest Litigation | |

4. Environment and Politics in India 63
- 4.1 The Emergence of Environmental Policy
 - 4.2 Implementation Deficits
 - 4.3 Opposition to Government Deficiencies
 - 4.4 The Situation of the Calcutta Agglomeration
 - 4.4.1 The Major Challenges
 - 4.4.2 Administrative Slack
 - 4.4.3 Environmental Activists
5. The Conflict over the East Calcutta Wetlands 84
- 5.1 Land Use in East Calcutta and Patterns of Urban Sprawl
 - 5.1.1 The ‘Waste Recycling Region’
 - 5.1.2 An Area Unfit for Urban Growth
 - 5.1.3 Government Policy Statements
 - 5.1.4 The Example of Salt Lake City
 - 5.2 The Pre-Litigation Pro-Wetlands Campaign
 - 5.2.1 The Pro-Conservation Network in the Bureaucracy
 - 5.2.2 Bureaucrats Mobilize Pressure Groups
 - 5.3 *PUBLIC v The State of West Bengal*
 - 5.3.1 The Initial Writ Petition
 - 5.3.2 The Court Proceedings
 - 5.3.3 The Judgement of 24 September 1992
 - 5.3.4 A Summary Assessment of the First Phase of Proceedings
 - 5.3.5 The Dispute over the World Trade Centre Continues
 - 5.4 *M.C. Mehta v The Union of India*
 - 5.4.1 Suggestions for a Calcutta Leather Complex
 - 5.4.2 The Proceedings in the Supreme Court
 - 5.4.3 A Wetlands Location for the Leather Complex
 - 5.5 PUBLIC’s Pending Contempt Accusations
 - 5.6 *Surojit Srimani v the State of West Bengal*
 - 5.7 Conservation Initiatives of the State Government
 - 5.8 The Wetlands Six Years after the First Judgement

6. <i>The Howrah Matter</i>	143
6.1 The Civic Situation in the Howrah Corporation	
6.2 The Howrah Ganatantrik Nagarik Samiti	
6.3 Moving the Judiciary	
6.3.1 The Role of Supreme Court	
6.3.2 Proceedings before the Green Bench	
6.4 Individual Issues	
6.4.1 The Howrah Maidan	
6.4.2 Bellilious Park and the Second Hoogly Bridge	
6.4.3 The Police Morgue	
6.4.4 The Fish and Betel Markets	
6.4.5 Major Unresolved Issues	
6.5 An assessment: The Court's Role in Changing the Polity	
7. Ethnographic Observations: An Overarching Lack of Trust	182
7.1 The Approach of 'Thick Description'	
7.2 The Judiciary	
7.2.1 Non-transparency and Corruption Claims	
7.2.2 Technical Skills and Professional Attitudes	
7.3 The Environmentalist Network	
7.3.1 Conspiracy Theories	
7.3.2 Impeded Cooperation	
8. Conclusion: Rudimentary Public Sphere and an Unresponsive State	207
Annexures	221
Timetable of events concerning the East Calcutta wetlands / Timetable of events concerning the <i>Howrah Matter</i> / Rough Sketch of wetlands map	
References	226
Books, Journals and Reports / Newspapers / Websites / Legal Documents	

Acknowledgements

This project would not have been possible but for the help of very many people. First of all, I would like to thank Subhas Datta and Ashis K. Ghosh. In very different ways, their contribution to environmental activism in Calcutta is essential. Without their kind support, my understanding of the issues would have remained inconclusive. Sandip Chattopadhyay was also of great help—as friend and never tiring guide to Calcutta’s life world. I also owe gratitude to the management of Deutsche Welle for making possible an unusual part-time work scheme and thereby enabling me to spend months on end doing research in India.

I would like to thank the following people in Europe for their support, encouragement and exchange of ideas: Abdullah Al-Farooq, Thomas Bärthlein, Annegret Böhme, Dieter Conrad, Roberto Davini, Barbara Dembowski, Christoph and Elisabeth Dembowski, Britta Demmer, Ulrike Devers, Angelika Ditscheid, Ulrike Fleischer, Christina Gruber, Mahesh Jha, Regina Junga, Karen Kleinwort, Richard Kortmann, Uli Kowol, Antje Lehmann, Jenny Luesby, Wolf-Dieter Michaeli, Shanti Naskar, Elisabeth Plum, Anke Rasper, Reinhard Salomon, Nathalie van Riesenbeck, Glynn Williams and Helmut Willke.

Overseas, mostly of course in India, are the following people whom I would equally like to thank: Nripen Bandyopadhyay, Amyia Bagchi, Samar Bagchi and family, Nivedita Bajaj, Bob Barnum and

family, Boro Baski, Ipsita Basu, Jyoti and Malabika Chattopadhyay, C.R. Datta, Shajahan and Ratna Farouk, Lopamudra Ghosh, Leena Hembron, Elizabeth Hoddy, Bernard Imhasly, Martin Kämpchen, Ingrid-Maria Keimel-Metz, Bonani Kakkar, Henrietta Löwisch, the late Swami Lokeshwarananda and everyone else at Ramakrishna Mission, Gol Park, Siddhartha Mitra, Surendra Munshi, Sona Murmu, Saswanti Naik, Sandy Pappas, S.V. Raman, Mohit Ray, Aditi Roy Ghatak, Anjalika Sharma, Aseema Sinha, Subrata and Monju Sinha, and Dana Sugu. German Technical Cooperation (GTZ) was interested in my project, and I would like to thank this institution for financing one of my trips to India.

Prof. Dietmar Rothermund (Heidelberg), Wolter von Tiesenhausen (Deutsche Welle, Bonn/Berlin) and Adelheid Tröscher (MP) were so kind as to personally appeal to the Indian Ambassador in Bonn when time was running short and the visa was not granted months after application. Sorin Sociu came to the rescue when laptops, hard disks, floppies and power supplies failed me in Calcutta's humid climate and dusty air. Cooperation with Ajitha G.S., Rasna Dhillon and Aparajita Basu at OUP, and Latha Anantharaman, has been a pleasure. In the earlier stages, my mother Gertrud Dembowski, my brother-in-law Bruno Dembowski and Sylvie Solanet were untiring proofreaders — patiently going through various versions of the manuscript again and again. All remaining mistakes and inaccuracies are, of course, my responsibility.

Glossary

AIIHPH	— All India Institute of Hygiene and Public Health
Benami	— illegal land holding
Bhery	— Fish pond
BJP	— Bharatiya Janta Party
Bigha	— measurement of territory: 3 bighas equal 4000m ²
CEMSAP	— Calcutta Environment Management Strategy and Action Plan (Undertaking of GoWB and ODA)
CMD	— Calcutta Metropolitan District
CMDA	— Calcutta Metropolitan Development Authority
CPCB	— Central Pollution Control Board
CPM	— Communist Party of India (Marxist)
CSIR	— Council of Scientific and Industrial Research (GoI)
DCL	— Development Consultants Ltd.
FACE	— Forum for Action and Coordination on Environment
GNS	— Howrah Ganatantrik Nagarik Samiti
GoI	— Government of India
GoWB	— Government of West Bengal
HIT	— Howrah Improvement Trust
HMC	— Howrah Municipal Corporation
IBRD	— World Bank (International Bank for Reconstruction and Development)
IMF	— International Monetary Fund
IWMED	— Institute for Wetland Management and Ecological Design, 'Wetland Institute'
Lathi	— Police truncheon of wood or bamboo

MoEF	—	Ministry of Environment and Forests
NEERI	—	National Environmental Engineering Research Institute
OBC	—	Other Backward Classes
ODA	—	Overseas Development Administration (UK)
OECD	—	Organization for Economic Cooperation and Development
Panchayat	—	Elected village council
PUBLIC	—	People United for Better Living in Calcutta
WBPCB	—	West Bengal Pollution Control Board
WWF	—	World Wide Fund for Nature